

Pacific Northwest Tribal Climate Change Project Meeting Notes

September 27, 2011

Participants:

- Jose Aguto, National Congress of American Indians
- Jamie Barbour, Forest Service Pacific Northwest Research Station
- Marla Emery, Forest Service Northern Research Station
- Laura Gephardt, Columbia River Intertribal Fish Commission
- Garry Harris, Forest Service, Region 6 Tribal Relations
- Jenni Hoffman, EcoAdapt
- Rob Jones, Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission
- Kathy Lynn, University of Oregon
- Don Motanic, Intertribal Timber Council
- Kari Neumeyer, Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission
- Patricia Tillman, National Wildlife Federation
- Carl Scheeler, Confederated Tribes of the Umatilla Indian Reservation
- Kirsten Vinyeta, University of Oregon

Meeting Minutes – Table of Contents

Welcome and Introductions	1
Pacific Northwest Climate Change Collaboration and the Northwest Science Center.....	2
Climate Change Effects & Adaptation in the Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems in the North Pacific LCC	2
Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment Training	3
Traditional Ecological Knowledge and Climate Change Meeting	3
2011/2012 Tribal Climate Change Project Research Agenda	4
Proposed Research Strategies and Action Items.....	4
Upcoming Climate Change Events.....	5
October 4, 2011 WebEx on the DOI Northwest Climate Science Center Science Plan	5
November 2011 Salmon in a Changing Climate	5
May 2012 conference on Indigenous Peoples and Climate Change	5
July 2012 - Climate Change Symposium in Washington D.C.	6
Funding Opportunities.....	6
Partner Updates	6
Great Lakes Tribal Climate Change Summit	6
American Indian Responses to Environmental Challenges	6
Washington Internships for Native Students	6
Our Natural Resources: Honoring the Natural Legacy of Indian Country	6
National Climate Assessment.....	6
Wisdom of the Elders Radio - Series Four: Indigenous Responses to Climate Change	7

Welcome and Introductions

Kathy introduced the three students at the University of Oregon who will be working on the Tribal Climate Change project in the coming year. Kirsten Vinyeta (who was on the call) is beginning her first year of the Environment Studies Master’s program. Yochi Zakai is a third-year law student in the UO Law School. Carson Viles is an undergraduate in the Environmental Studies Program and the Honors College at the UO and is a member of the Siletz Tribe. Kirsten will be researching how traditional knowledge can inform climate change assessments, planning and policy and Yochi will be researching the piece related to consultation and treaty rights. Carson will assist in managing the project website, work with Kathy on coordination of the PNW Tribal Climate Change Network, and develop new tribal climate change profiles.

The Network has grown to include over 75 people, and we had a very brief discussion about the email list. Until now, we have maintained an open list over the email so that everyone had a chance to see who is part of the Network, since the list of network participants is *not* made available on the website. Those on the call had no concerns about the open email list for the network.

Pacific Northwest Climate Change Collaboration and the Northwest Science Center

Lief Horwitz with the USGS gave a brief presentation on the Pacific Northwest Climate Change Collaborative (<http://www.c3.gov/>), the Northwest Climate Science Center and the Traditional Ecological Knowledge conference in Seattle. Lief talked about the opportunity to strengthen ties between the C3 group and the Tribal Climate Change Network, and will participate in Network calls in the future. The Pacific Northwest Climate Change Collaboration (C3) is intended to:

- Better organize, integrate and focus the federal community's efforts to address the effects of climate change on natural resources in the Pacific Northwest region.
- Foster collaborative efforts between research, management and regulatory agencies and programs ("knowledge-to-action")
- Provide a portal to the federal climate change community in the Pacific Northwest, for states, academic organizations, tribal organizations and others.

C3 holds regular conference calls on the fourth Tuesday of every month, and meet in person (and via video-conference between Portland and Seattle) a few times each year. Their focus is on collaboration and coordination, but they have worked on some specific products as well. Once such product is a database of federal climate change work in the northwest. Through the *Pacific Northwest Climate Change Inventory*, C3 agencies have identified research, research tools, models, modeled scenarios, monitoring programs/projects and assessments related to Climate Change in the Pacific Northwest that they have initiated or completed since 2005. These are projects that C³ agencies initiated, undertook, funded, or extensively partnered with others. 209 projects have been entered in the C3 inventory database and can be accessed at: http://www.c3.gov/PNW_inventory.cfm.

Northwest Climate Science Center and Landscape Conservation Cooperatives

Lief also briefly presented on the Northwest Climate Science Center, which has a stakeholder advisory committee that includes 22 agencies and organizations, including three Landscape Conservation Cooperatives, thirteen federal agencies and three tribal organizations (Affiliated Tribes of Northwest Indians, Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission and the Columbia Intertribal Fish Commission. Lief suggested that on our next call, we could have a more in-depth discussion of the Landscape Conservation Cooperatives (LCCs), which are public-private partnerships that recognize the challenges transcend political and jurisdictional boundaries and require a more networked approach to conservation—holistic, collaborative, adaptive and grounded in science to ensure the sustainability of America's land, water, wildlife and cultural resources. As a collaborative, LCCs seek to identify best practices, connect efforts, identify gaps, and avoid duplication through improved conservation planning and design. Partner agencies and organizations coordinate with each other while working within their existing authorities and jurisdictions. The three LCC's in the Pacific Northwest include:

- North Pacific LCC - <http://www.fws.gov/pacific/Climatechange/nplcc/>
- Great Basin LCC – http://www.blm.gov/id/st/en/prog/Great_Basin_LCC.html
- Great Northern LCC - <http://www.nrmisc.usgs.gov/gnlcc>

Don Motanic mentioned that this past summer the Pacific Northwest Climate Science Center had hosted a *climate change boot camp* at the University of Washington. ***Will there be another boot camp in 2012?***

National Wildlife Federation reports on Climate Change Effects and Adaptation Approaches in the Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems in the North Pacific LCC

Patricia Tillman with the National Wildlife Federation gave an update on the reports recently completed on the climate change effects and adaptation approaches in the marine and freshwater ecosystems in the North Pacific LCC. They now have additional funding to convene focus groups in order to vet the results in the draft reports, which are intended to be driven by the needs and knowledge of experts in the region, and assist in advance adaptation and management in the region. There will be teleconferences in November and December and focus groups most likely in February. The reports will be completed in May 2012. Tribes interested in participating in the focus groups and sharing their research priorities and management needs should contact Patricia Tillman at TillmannP@nwf.org.

Carl Sheeler with the Confederated Tribes of the Umatilla Indian Reservation is participating in the Great Northern LCC and shared that they are working on a tabletop for analysis and modeling, and delivering outputs from those

efforts. Jennie Hoffman with EcoAdapt shared that Josh Lawler at the University of Washington have developed and are extending their vulnerability assessment tools to the Great Northern LCC.

Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment Training and EcoAdapt Update

Jennie Hoffman with EcoAdapt shared that there will be a series of climate change vulnerability assessment trainings around the country in the coming year. The course is based on January 2011 publication "Scanning the Conservation Horizon - A Guide to Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment" (www.nwf.org/vulnerabilityguide). The guidance document is a product of an expert workgroup on climate change vulnerability assessment convened by the National Wildlife Federation in collaboration with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, U.S. Geological Survey, U.S. Forest Service Rocky Mountain Research Station, National Park Service, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, Doris Duke Charitable Foundation, and the Department of Defense Legacy Resource Management Program. This course is designed to guide conservation and resource management practitioners in two essential elements in the design of climate adaptation plans. Specifically, it will provide guidance in identifying which species or habitats are likely to be most strongly affected by projected changes; and understanding why these resources are likely to be vulnerable. More information on the training course is attached to the email. Upcoming training sessions are scheduled for:

- *November 14-17, 2011 – Anchorage, Alaska*
- *January 10-12, 2012 – St. Petersburg, Florida*
- *January 24-26, 2012 – Seattle, Washington*
- *March 20-22, 2012 – Fort Collins, Colorado*
- *June 19-21, 2012 – Shepherdstown, West Virginia*

Patricia congratulated Jennie and shared that the Department of Interior recently awarded Jennie and the co-authors of the Vulnerability Assessment Guide DOI's highest award for Partners in Conservation. Jennie also mentioned that EcoAdapt has funding to work on climate change in Washington, specifically on coastal marine spatial planning. Anyone interested in presentations or workshops on climate change capacity building should contact Jennie at: jennie.hoffman@ecoadapt.org.

Jose mentioned the National Oceans Council and the National Coastal and Marine Spatial Planning Workshop – he suggested that there should be a national tribal strategy to encourage the Administration and/or Congress to direct more attention to climate change issues. There are many disparate strands and it is difficult to coalesce around a new national agenda. NCAI and ONR are working with the Administration on these issues, and Jose mentioned that John Antonio was recently appointed to be the Climate Change Coordinator for the BIA.

⇒ **Action Item:** Facilitate a discussion with the PNW Tribal Climate Change Work on climate change policy and how to prepare for what the Administration and Congress may do in the future.

Traditional Ecological Knowledge and Climate Change Meeting

A meeting on Exploring Traditional Ecological Knowledge's Role in Responding and Adapting to Climate Change and Variability was held on September 15 and 16, 2011 at the Seattle Public Library. The Affiliated Tribes of Northwest Indians (ATNI) with sponsorship and support from the Pacific Northwest Climate Change Collaboration (C3), the Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA), the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (FWS) and the U.S. Geological Survey (USGS) hosted the meeting.

Lief reported that 75 people attended the meeting, including a mix of tribal representatives from the Northwest and Alaska, as well as representatives from the academic community, non-governmental organizations, and state and federal agencies. The meeting included discussion on the need to strengthen the connection with tribes through the Northwest Climate Science Center. Outcomes from the meeting included a draft a resolution that was presented at the Affiliated Tribes of Northwest Indians annual meeting last week (hosted by the Tulalip Tribes). If it was adopted, then it may be introduced at the National Congress of American Indians annual meeting this November in Portland, OR. The resolution focused on the importance of considering traditional ecological knowledge in understanding climate change, and the serious threat that climate change poses to tribal resources. There is a desire to strengthen tribal science capacity and federal science capacity.

2011/2012 Tribal Climate Change Project Research Agenda

Having sent out a draft of the research agenda prior to the call, Kathy facilitated a discussion on the core research areas. Research Area 1 examines government-to-government relationships in addressing climate change, including consultation and the trust responsibility, cross-landscape climate change assessments and tribal involvement in federal and state climate change plans. We also seek to examine the role of consultation, the implications for federal land managers, and the management of on and off-reservation resources as climate change affects the composition and distribution of culturally important species. Research Area 2 aims to increase understanding about tribal adaptation, and will initially focus the use of traditional knowledge in climate change assessments and planning, and will also to research area 1 as it relates to understanding the government-to-government relationship in developing and implementing climate change assessments and strategies and managing on and off-reservations resources.

The majority of the feedback focused on the consultation piece, and the group discussed the needs for applied research that bolsters the effectiveness of the government-to-government relationship. The notes from this part of the discussion are outlined under the key action items that came out of the conversation.

Proposed Research Strategies and Action Items

- ⇒ **Action Item:** Facilitate a discussion with the PNW Tribal Climate Change Work on climate change policy and how to prepare for what the Administration and Congress may do in the future.

- ⇒ **Action Item:** Investigate the level of coordination among different agencies in terms of what the consultation policy directives are and how they are implemented.
 - Could agencies coordinate more closely when it comes to consulting on climate related projects?
 - Jose suggested that an example is the National Ocean Council, which could serve as a conduit for consultation with tribes among the six federal agencies represented on the Council.
 - A lot of the tribes feel overly consulted with on the consultation process that Obama administration has engaged in and want to engage more directly and see more meaningful outcomes from consultation.
 - The magnitude of the levels that consultation must occur at could make efforts to consolidate consultation processes unwieldy. There is a need to look at the cumulative effects of programmatic policies and projects.
 - Efforts such as the National Fish, Wildlife, and Plants Climate Adaptation Strategy (<http://www.wildlifeadaptationstrategy.gov/>) is an example where this kind of coordination on consultation with tribes could occur.
 - Effective relationships happen at a place-based level. Coordination in consultation must still recognize and place value on consultation at the most local and individual levels.

- ⇒ **Action Item:** Research examples and best practices related to consultation
 - Find the best practices that have really worked in creating and effective government-to-government relationship, and apply those best practices to the climate agenda.
 - Tribal needs should drive consultation (not the other way around)
 - Help agencies “work smart” and reduce silos.
 - Effectiveness of the Federal-Tribal Relationship: Northwest Forest Plan Tribal Monitoring Report (<http://www.reo.gov/monitoring/reports/15yr-report/tribal/index.shtml>).

- ⇒ **Action Item:** Clarify the kind of consultation that needs to occur related to consultation and climate change.
 - Map out the specific types of activities we are talking about consulting for and as they relate to:
 - Assessment, planning implementation and monitoring (local and cross-jurisdictional)
 - National policy
 - Agency programs
 - Interagency processes
 - What climate change means for treaty rights
 - Create a list of the specific issues and sectors that agencies must consult with tribes in regards to

- climate change (assessments, planning, implementation, etc.)
- Identify federal actions and categorize them; facilitate national policy so that these actions are clear and meaningful consultation does occur.

⇒ **Action Item:** Don't just frame the issue around consultation

- Consultation may be to narrow a frame for the discussion. What is needed is an effective Tribal-Federal relationship that recognizes tribes as sovereigns in all aspects of addressing climate change.
- Create a framework for what meaningful consultation looks like, and the tangible outcomes that tribes and federal agencies are working towards and can benefit from.

Other issues to consider:

- Obama's directive for federal agencies to update their consultation policies could lead to the next stage:
 - How do these consultation policies compare? How can the agencies work together to foster a more effective federal-tribal relationship that is based on two sovereign nations working together?
- Consultation is a two way street:
 - The execution of responsibility for consultation is on both sides.
 - Tribal needs should drive consultation
 - Often, tribes have too many requests for consultation to result in meaningful outcomes or even for the tribes to respond in a timely matter. The consultation process gets diluted with so many requests from public agencies.
 - One suggestion was to create federal and tribal directories for staff that are able to do consultation.

Upcoming Climate Change Events

A WebEx on the DOI Northwest Climate Science Center Science Plan - October 4, 2011) 12:30- 3:00 pm Pacific

The WebEx will focus on a discussion of the draft of the Northwest Climate Science Center's *Science Agenda: Framing Directions for Northwest Climate Science*. The draft Science Agenda provides an overview of the NW CSC and includes a summary of Pacific Northwest climate science needs, a discussion of climate change in the Northwest, and overarching Northwest science goals. The WebEx is an opportunity for you to engage and offer comments and modifications to the draft Science Agenda, particularly as it relates to your specific Tribal interests and concerns. We realize that Northwest Tribes have relied upon specific places and environments for their cultural, spiritual, economic, and natural resource needs for thousands of years, and we value your deep, long-term and site-specific knowledge and perspective.

- *When:* October 4, 2011 (Tuesday) 12:30- 3:00 pm Pacific Time WebEx
- *Phone Line* (AUDIO PORTION): Dial 703-648-4848 and enter passcode 72791#
- *WebEx:* (VIDEO PORTION, via the internet from your desktop or laptop computer):
- Press and hold Ctrl on your keyboard and click on the following link to go to your meeting.
<https://usgs.webex.com/usgs/j.php?ED=158264047&UID=481603622&PW=NNmE1NTZkyYx&RT=MiMO>
 Enter meeting number 710 901 719 and meeting password: climate

Salmon in a Changing Climate, November 15–17, 2011 • Hilton Hotel • Portland, Oregon

Salmon in a Changing Climate: Practical management options for an era of environmental change will be held November 15–17, 2011 in Portland, Oregon. This international, participatory workshop will examine whether decisions about management of salmon and their habitats can be practically informed by the newest scientific insights on expected responses of wild Pacific salmon to climate and environmental change. Information is available at: <http://www.stateofthesalmon.org/conference2011/>

May 23 - 24, 2012 conference on Indigenous Peoples and Climate Change

On Thursday, May 24, 2012, the [University of Oregon](http://www.uoregon.edu/) and its [Robert D. Clark Honors College](http://www.uoregon.edu/~robertdclark/) will host a student-focused conference on "Indigenous People, Climate Change, and Environmental Knowledge." Students from a diversity of disciplines will present research related to climate and culture in the Americas alongside faculty and graduate students. Keynote speakers include Daniel Wildcat and Larry Merculieff. More information on the conference is available at: <http://uoclimateconference.wordpress.com>. The Pacific Northwest Tribal Climate

Change Network will also host an in-person meeting on Wednesday, May 23rd from 3:30 – 5:30 pm. We will provide an opportunity for people to tele-conference in that are not able to be there in person.

July 2012 - Climate Change Symposium in Washington D.C.

Rob Jones with the Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission gave a brief update on the Climate Change Symposium that will be held in Washington, D.C., July 16-19, 2012. The four Coastal Treaty Tribes (Hoh, Makah, Quileute, and Quinault) of Washington State are hosting a Climate Change Symposium in conjunction with the U.S. Office of National Marine Sanctuaries, the Smithsonian National Museum of the American Indian, and the Nature Conservancy. The Symposium will be held at the National Museum of the American Indian and will feature personal stories from indigenous people in coastal regions around the U.S. Rob will send on more information about the Symposium in the near future.

Funding Opportunities

Model Forest Policy Program – 2012 Climate Solutions University

The application period for the Model Forestry Policy Program – 2012 Climate Solutions University has been extended to Tuesday, October 4th. If you are interested in applying, visit: http://www.mfpp.org/?page_id=438 and contact Jeff Morris at: jeff@mfpp.org, (530) 355-9880.

Other Partner Updates

Great Lakes Tribal Climate Change Summit

Marla Emery with the USDA Forest Service Northern Research Station gave a short recap on the August Great Lake Tribal Climate Change Summit. The summit was hosted by the College of Menominee Nation and the Menominee Sustainable Development Institute and attended by members of the Menominee Nation and tribes from Northern Wisconsin. Marla said that one outcome from the meeting would be a declaration of principles from the summit, along with a written summary. Key discussion points included that tribes must be front and center in policy development, and involved in framing the issues of climate change, affects on tribal communities and all people.

American Indian Responses to Environmental Challenges: <http://www.nmai.si.edu/environment/>.

Don Motanic shared that the National Museum of the American Indian recently created a website documenting American Indian Responses to Environmental Challenges. Tribes featured on the site include the Lummi Nation in Washington the Leech Lake Band in Minnesota.

Washington Internships for Native Students: <http://www.american.edu/washingtonsemester/wins/>

Don Motanic recently met with Dave Cleaves, USDA Forest Service Climate Change Advisor to the Chief. Dave is interested in identifying tribal college students with an interest in climate change research, and will be trying to recruit a student through the Washington Interns for Native Students program in Washington D.C. through American University.

Our Natural Resources: Honoring the Natural Legacy of Indian Country

Jose gave a quick update on ONR. They are working on their revised strategy and may present this at the NCAI conference in November. The first draft of the strategy is at: <http://www.ournaturalresources.org/national-tribal-resources-stra/>

National Climate Assessment

Kathy gave a very brief update on the National Climate Assessment. Jose suggested that one of the significant aspects of the upcoming National Climate Assessment report is that it will include a separate tribal chapter for the first time, and really put tribal issues at the forefront. Tribal issues will also be represented in the regional and sectoral chapters as well. One issue that is still being figured out is how grey literature will be incorporated, since the majority of information in the past was primarily scientifically driven. Because there is not a lot of peer-reviewed literature on climate change and tribal issues, they are working on a strategy on how the scientists will incorporate grey literature. The National Climate Assessment Development and Advisory Committee issued a

formal request for input to the NCA that is due October 1, 2011 (<http://www.globalchange.gov/what-we-do/assessment/backgroundprocess/notices>). However, they also formally created a National Tribal Technical Input team (led by Bull Bennet of Kiksapa Consulting), so there is an opportunity to contribute to the NCA without formally submitting an expression of interest through the Tribal Technical Input team. Members of the Tribal Technical Input Team represent regions throughout the U.S., including the Pacific Northwest, Southwest, Midwest, East, Southeast, Alaska, and the Pacific Islands.

Wisdom of the Elders Radio - Series Four: Indigenous Responses to Climate Change

The producers of *Wisdom of the Elders Radio Program* are currently planning its next series of American Indian public radio programs. We are employing a higher level of multimedia journalism – high definition audio and video, science journalism, and new media web content – as we prepare for radio production by 2013. We are now accepting input regarding scientific and cultural content from tribes, tribal colleges, science universities and federal agencies. *Wisdom of the Elders Radio: Series Four* will feature eight Northwest tribes that are responding sustainably to unprecedented environmental degradation and climate change. Native elders, scientists, educators and cultural leaders from tribes in Alaska, Washington, Oregon and Montana will share both traditional and STEM (science, technology, engineering and math) knowledge along with oral history, cultural arts and messages from exemplary role models. The series will focus on observations and positive environmental practices being proposed and developed by tribes as they work to preserve the earth and moderate climate change impacts.

The radio series will be the foundation of student-centered, culturally tailored multimedia STEM curriculum being developed by Wisdom. It will be designed to inform and engage Native American middle and high school students, their families, and tribal college students of diverse ages in climate change issues; motivate them to take an increased number of STEM classes; and encourage them to explore academic careers in STEM sciences. Although our primary audience is Native students of all ages, the series will be aired on National Public Radio stations thus increasing understanding and respect for Native American culture and its diverse peoples across social and racial boundaries. To discuss this exciting Native American radio series with us, please feel free to contact Isobel Charlé by calling (503) 775-4014 or by e-mail at isobel@WisdomoftheElders.org